

Message

From: Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]
Sent: 8/11/2018 10:52:18 PM
To: Macpherson, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8bbdd3b262a14ab5ae26c5a745337667-Macpherson, Alex]; Adamantiades, Mikhail [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]; Keaveny, Brian [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=13ac837699a94966adb381b8c7c380f9-Keaveny, Br]
Subject: First EE comment in 3.8 is MISHA's to respond to per earlier agreement
Importance: High

Guys,

This comment is Misha's to respond to. He volunteered to do so after I flagged it for either him or Brian to address.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Let me know if you have any questions. If you're not quick, Alex or Dave will respond to it and we may not like it.

Thanks,
Joe

Joe Bryson
Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

Message

From: Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]
Sent: 6/28/2018 6:35:48 PM
To: Culligan, Kevin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5ab7ef4a59614fd4b4485668c42818c7-KCULLIGA]; Sasser, Erika [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=477638fe84004800bdf8e62fe3cafc8-ESASSER]; Swanson, Nicholas [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=3a03c53d255d4581acb3cb66f04e5df1-Swanson, Nicholas]
CC: Hutson, Nick [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b7e6dc331d174798a3a269070576d896-Hutson, Nick]; Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]; Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]; Adamantiades, Mikhail [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'
Attachments: Draft - 111(d) RIA Executive Summary - 06282018.docx

Thanks Erika and Kevin.

Nick Swanson, attached is the draft RIA executive summary ready to share with Bill Wehrum today.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I will upload this version of the executive summary to SharePoint so it will be the starting point for incorporating any feedback we receive next week. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,
- Brian

From: Culligan, Kevin
Sent: Thursday, June 28, 2018 1:55 PM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Cc: Hutson, Nick <Hutson.Nick@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>; Adamantiades, Mikhail <Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Good for me too. Thanks Brian to you and the rest of the team for the hard work that went into this and that continues to go into finishing the RIA.

From: Sasser, Erika
Sent: Thursday, June 28, 2018 1:53 PM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>
Cc: Hutson, Nick <Hutson.Nick@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>; Adamantiades, Mikhail <Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Sounds good to me.

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Thursday, June 28, 2018 9:29 AM
To: Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>; Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>
Cc: Hutson, Nick <Hutson.Nick@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>; Adamantiades, Mikhail <Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Thanks Erika and Kevin. Your edits in the document are very helpful.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Culligan, Kevin
Sent: Wednesday, June 27, 2018 6:09 PM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>
Cc: Hutson, Nick <Hutson.Nick@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Sasser, Erika
Sent: Wednesday, June 27, 2018 5:50 PM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Hi Brian—I think the ex sum looks very good. I had a few minor comments (marked as OAQPS/Erika Sasser) but overall I think this looks right on. Good to send forward when you all are ready.

From: Keaveny, Brian [mailto:no-reply@sharepointonline.com]
Sent: Wednesday, June 27, 2018 12:44 PM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>
Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Hi Erika and Kevin,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Open ch1 - executive summ.docx

See more related to Keaveny, Brian in Delve.



Get the SharePoint mobile app!



Message

From: Culligan, Kevin [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5AB7EF4A59614FD4B4485668C42818C7-KCULLIGA]
Sent: 4/16/2018 6:17:46 PM
To: Adamantiades, Mikhail [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]; Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Er]
Subject: FW: 111 RIA discussion, RTP C300C, Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 conference ID Personal Privacy/Ex. 6
Attachments: chan et al - 2017 - efficiency and environmental impacts of electricity restructuring on coal-fired power plants.pdf

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Monday, April 16, 2018 1:07 PM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 111 RIA discussion, RTP C300C, 1-202-991-0477, conference ID 1200676

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

Message

From: Snyder, Carolyn [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=4FAFC36D202F4DE3A925E1DF708EDD9E-SNYDER, CAR]
Sent: 2/13/2018 10:19:17 PM
To: Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]
Subject: RE: FYI - some CPP-related info

Thanks.

Carolyn Snyder
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
snyder.carolyn@epa.gov
202-343-9616

From: Bryson, Joe
Sent: Tuesday, February 13, 2018 5:13 PM
To: Snyder, Carolyn <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>
Cc: Moss, Jacob <Moss.Jacob@epa.gov>
Subject: FYI - some CPP-related info

Carolyn, [I typed this before we spoke ... maybe still of interest ... or not]

Just FYI ... attached is current staff-level draft of RIA plan for 111d proposal.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Joe

Joe Bryson
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

Message

From: Culligan, Kevin [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5AB7EF4A59614FD4B4485668C42818C7-KCULLIGA]
Sent: 9/27/2017 3:02:28 PM
To: Tsirigotis, Peter [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d19c179f3ccb4fadb48e3ae85563f132-PTSIRIGO]
Subject: Can we touch base on this language?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Stenhouse, Jeb
Sent: Wednesday, September 27, 2017 10:25 AM
To: Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: Commitments made in RIA draft

FYI

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Stenhouse, Jeb" <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Date: September 27, 2017 at 10:24:32 AM EDT
To: "Harvey, Reid" <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>, "Haeuber, Richard" <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>, "Gunning, Paul" <Gunning.Paul@epa.gov>, "Snyder, Carolyn" <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: Commitments made in RIA draft

Please let me know if you have any direction regarding this language.

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Eschmann, Erich" <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>
Date: September 27, 2017 at 10:10:09 AM EDT
To: "Stenhouse, Jeb" <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Subject: Commitments made in RIA draft

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Erich Eschmann
Clean Air Markets Division
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone
202 343-2359 Fax
eschmann.erich@epa.gov

Message

From: Sasser, Erika [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=477638FE84004800BFDF8E62FE3CAFC8-ESASSER]
Sent: 10/5/2017 10:29:11 PM
To: Dunham, Sarah [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=a9444681441e4521ad92ae7d42919223-SDUNHAM]
CC: Lewis, Josh [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b22d1d3bb3f84436a524f76ab6c79d7e-JOLEWIS]; Page, Steve [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=269c9581404542e79501f2bf0379a2ad-SPAGE]
Subject: CPP Proposal and RIA
Attachments: EO12866_CPP Repeal 2060-AT55 Proposal_20171005_RLSO.DOCX; EO12866_CPP Repeal 2060-AT55 Proposal RIA_20171005_RLSO.DOCX

Attached are the latest versions of the CPP RIA and preamble 12866 section reflecting changes made in response to OMB comments: **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,

Erika

Message

From: McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 9/27/2017 8:44:49 PM
To: Dravis, Samantha [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=ece53f0610054e669d9dffe0b3a842df-Dravis, Sam]
CC: Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]; Gunasekara, Mandy [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=53d1a3caa8bb4ebab8a2d28ca59b6f45-Gunasekara,]
Subject: FW: Draft RIA and supporting files
Attachments: forgone benefit and avoided cost tables - 09272017.xlsx; present value analysis - 09272017.xlsx; forgone climate benefit analysis - 09272017.xlsx; forgone health co-benefit analysis - 09272017.xlsx; DS-EE-driven reduction in expenditures - 09272017.xlsx; CPP_Final_RIA_2015.pdf; EO12866_CPP Repeal 2060-AT55 Proposal RIA Spreadsheet_20170927.xlsx; EO12866_CPP Repeal 2060-AT55 Proposal RIA_20170927.docx; Response_to_Interagency_Comments_092717.docx

Importance: High

Just in case. This is a complete set of files as sent to OMB. The RIA is in the pdf file. You can ignore the excel spreadsheet files.

From: Culligan, Kevin
Sent: Wednesday, September 27, 2017 4:40 PM
To: Szabo, Aaron L. EOP/OMB <Aaron_L_Szabo@omb.eop.gov>
Cc: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Tsirigotis, Peter <Tsirigotis.Peter@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Draft RIA and supporting files
Importance: High

From: Macpherson, Alex
Sent: Wednesday, September 27, 2017 4:37 PM
To: Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>
Cc: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: Draft RIA and supporting files
Importance: High

Kevin

Please find attached the draft RIA and ROCIS spreadsheet.

The attached spreadsheets, which were used to produce the results in the draft RIA, were requested by interagency reviewers.

We are also including the 2015 Final CPP RIA as supporting documentation.

Let me know if you have any questions. Thanks.

Alex

Alexander Macpherson, PhD
Senior Economist
Office of Air and Radiation
US Environmental Protection Agency
919-541-9770

Message

From: Harvey, Reid [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=F8EC31CAAD5048DB83F210032847DE32-RHARVE02]
Sent: 8/8/2018 8:20:09 PM
To: Vijayan, Abi [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=2f6e6c1fb9bc448fb9810a56e5a4725c-Vijayan, Abi]
Subject: FW: RIA info on emissions

Here are the tables we discussed.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Reid

From: Adamantiades, Mikhail
Sent: Friday, August 3, 2018 10:52 AM
To: Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>
Cc: Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>
Subject: RIA info on emissions

Reid-

As we discussed, here is the relevant emissions data in the RIA. We will pull some additional info/data for Monday to discuss with you.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

.....

.....

Message

From: Morgan, Cynthia [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=904F54AD8D7A4887BDDF97D2E67F7D7F-CMORGA03]
Sent: 10/5/2017 5:35:36 PM
To: McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]
CC: Griffiths, Charles [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b6cf9d6d6dd24f5c825170cddcd13e4c-Griffiths, Charles]
Subject: FW: Steam Electric postponement
Attachments: WA1-11_T4_Memo_ForgoneBenefitsCosts_2017-08-15.docx

Hi Al,

Attached is the memo describing the cost savings and foregone benefits of the steam electric delay.

Cynthia

From: Massey, Matt
Sent: Tuesday, September 12, 2017 9:57 AM
To: Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Morgan, Cynthia <Morgan.Cynthia@epa.gov>
Cc: Moore, Chris <Moore.Chris@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Steam Electric postponement

Here's the memo (this is a draft version – I don't think we have a final but I could check if its final). Enjoy.

From: Moore, Chris
Sent: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:37 AM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Massey, Matt <Massey.Matt@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Steam Electric postponement

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Marten, Alex

Sent: Monday, August 28, 2017 12:20 PM

To: Moore, Chris <Moore.Chris@epa.gov>; Massey, Matt <Massey.Matt@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Steam Electric postponement

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Moore, Chris
Sent: Monday, August 28, 2017 10:22 AM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Massey, Matt <Massey.Matt@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Steam Electric postponement

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Monday, August 28, 2017 10:04 AM
To: Moore, Chris <Moore.Chris@epa.gov>; Massey, Matt <Massey.Matt@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Steam Electric postponement

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks.

--

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Moore, Chris
Sent: Monday, August 28, 2017 9:49 AM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Massey, Matt <Massey.Matt@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Steam Electric postponement

Hello All,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Thundiyil, Karen

Sent: Friday, August 25, 2017 4:44 PM

To: Massey, Matt <Massey.Matt@epa.gov>; Moore, Chris <Moore.Chris@epa.gov>

Subject: Steam Electric postponement

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

From: Rodrick, Christian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=6515DBE46DAE466DA53C8A3AA3BE8CC2-RODRICK, CH]
Sent: 8/29/2018 3:02:28 PM
To: Woods, Clint [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bc65010f5c2e48f4bc2aa050db50d198-Woods, Clin]
CC: Palich, Christian [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=330ad62e158d43af93fcbbece930d21a-Palich, Chr]
Subject: FW: INVITE: Affordable Clean Energy Rule Hill Staff Briefing

Clint,

Do we actually have a response to this/ is this something we would share?

*Christian Rodrick
Special Assistant
Congressional Affairs U.S. EPA
O: (202) 564-4828*

From: Vogel, Hannah (Markey) [mailto:Hannah_Vogel@markey.senate.gov]
Sent: Thursday, August 23, 2018 10:52 AM
To: Rodrick, Christian <rodrick.christian@epa.gov>
Cc: Goldsmith, William (Markey) <William_Goldsmith@markey.senate.gov>; Palich, Christian <palich.christian@epa.gov>; Griffith, Lindsey (Markey) <Lindsey_Griffith@markey.senate.gov>; Frye, Tony (Robert) <frye.robert@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: INVITE: Affordable Clean Energy Rule Hill Staff Briefing

Hi Christian,

Thanks for the quick response—unfortunately, I'm still a bit confused about this specific point. In the table below, is it comparing these scenarios to the base CPP case including EE that's looked at in chapter 3.8, or the base CPP case without EE?

Table 4-6 Estimated Incremental PM_{2.5} and Ozone-Related Premature Deaths and Illnesses in 2030*

		No CPP	2% HRI at \$50/kW	4.5% HRI at \$50/kW	4.5% HRI at \$100/kW
Avoided premature death among adults					
PM _{2.5}	Krewski <i>et al.</i> (2009)	470 (320 to 630)	410 (280 to 550)	410 (280 to 550)	330 (240 to 470)
	Lepeule <i>et al.</i> (2012)	1,100 (540 to 1,600)	940 (470 to 1,400)	940 (470 to 1,400)	800 (400 to 1,200)
Ozone	Smith <i>et al.</i> (2009)	24 (12 to 36)	38 (19 to 57)	16 (8 to 25)	12 (6 to 18)
	Jerrett <i>et al.</i> (2009)	86 (29 to 140)	140 (47 to 230)	59 (20 to 98)	43 (14 to 71)
PM_{2.5}-related non-fatal heart attacks among adults					
Peters <i>et al.</i> (2001)		490 (120 to 860)	430 (100 to 750)	430 (110 to 760)	360 (89 to 640)
Pooled estimate		53 (20 to 140)	46 (17 to 120)	47 (17 to 120)	39 (15 to 110)
All other morbidity effects					
Hospital admissions—cardiovascular (PM _{2.5})		120 (53 to 230)	110 (46 to 200)	110 (47 to 200)	91 (40 to 170)
Hospital admissions—respiratory (PM _{2.5} & O ₃)		130 (210 to 250)	110 (26 to 210)	140 (35 to 280)	87 (24 to 170)
ED visits for asthma (PM _{2.5} & O ₃)		250 (-50 to 620)	210 (-37 to 530)	280 (-51 to 690)	170 (-34 to 410)
Exacerbated asthma (PM _{2.5} & O ₃)		44,000 (-31,000 to 110,000)	40,000 (-29,000 to 96,000)	48,000 (-34,000 to 120,000)	29,000 (-20,000 to 69,000)
Minor restricted-activity days (PM _{2.5} & O ₃)		290,000 (200,000 to 370,000)	230,000 (160,000 to 310,000)	300,000 (210,000 to 390,000)	190,000 (140,000 to 250,000)
Acute bronchitis (PM _{2.5})		570 (-130 to 1,300)	500 (-120 to 1,100)	500 (-120 to 1,100)	420 (-99 to 940)
Upper resp. symptoms (PM _{2.5})		10,000 (1,900 to 19,000)	9,000 (1,600 to 16,000)	9,000 (1,600 to 16,000)	7,700 (1,400 to 14,000)
Lower resp. symptoms (PM _{2.5})		7,200 (2,800 to 12,000)	6,300 (2,400 to 10,000)	6,300 (2,400 to 10,000)	5,400 (2,000 to 8,700)
Lost work days (PM _{2.5})		48,000 (40,000 to 55,000)	42,000 (35,000 to 48,000)	42,000 (35,000 to 48,000)	35,000 (30,000 to 41,000)
School absence days (O ₃)		31,000 (11,000 to 71,000)	60,000 (22,000 to 140,000)	21,000 (7,700 to 48,000)	16,000 (5,600 to 35,000)

* Values rounded to two significant figures

From: Rodrick, Christian <rodrick.christian@epa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, August 23, 2018 10:45 AM

To: Vogel, Hannah (Markey) <Hannah.Vogel@markey.senate.gov>

Cc: Goldsmith, William (Markey) <William.Goldsmith@markey.senate.gov>; Palich, Christian

<palich.christian@epa.gov>; Griffith, Lindsey (Markey) <Lindsey.Griffith@markey.senate.gov>; Frye, Tony (Robert) <rfrye.robert@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: INVITE: Affordable Clean Energy Rule Hill Staff Briefing

Hannah,

I'm glad you found the briefing helpful. I just checked with our air office and I believe below should answer your question. Please let me know if I can do anything else for you.

"The CPP was stayed and was never implemented. As a result, the analyses accompanying the ACE rule looks at costs and benefits compared to two baselines: the world as it is without the CPP and, in the interest of transparency, emissions reductions expected under the never-implemented CPP. Compared to the CPP, the ACE rule has net benefits as high as \$3.4 billion. Compared to the world as it stands now, the ACE rule will result in dramatic reductions in emissions, including CO₂, mercury, and fine particulate matter precursors, as well as any resulting mortality and morbidity effects. EPA separately regulates these pollutants under its NAAQS and hazardous air pollutant programs, and the vast majority of the country is in attainment with health-protective standards for PM, NO_x, and SO_x set in the previous Administration.

In 2030, the ACE rule is projected to reduce emissions in the following amounts:

- CO2 emissions reduced by 13 to 27 million tons;
- SO2 emissions reduced by 7,000 to 15,000 tons;
- NOx emissions reduced by 8,000 to 15,000 tons.”

Christian Rodrick
Special Assistant
Congressional Affairs U.S. EPA
O: (202) 564-4828

From: Vogel, Hannah (Markey) [mailto:Hannah_Vogel@markey.senate.gov]
Sent: Thursday, August 23, 2018 9:40 AM
To: Rodrick, Christian <rodrick.christian@epa.gov>
Cc: Goldsmith, William (Markey) <William_Goldsmith@markey.senate.gov>; Griffith, Lindsey (Markey) <Lindsey_Griffith@markey.senate.gov>
Subject: RE: INVITE: Affordable Clean Energy Rule Hill Staff Briefing

Hi Christian,

Thanks for setting up that briefing yesterday, we found it helpful. One question that came up while looking at the RIA: do the health impacts data (Table 4-6) compare to a base CPP case with energy efficiency or without?

Best,

Hannah

From: Rodrick, Christian <rodrick.christian@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, August 21, 2018 11:02 AM
To: Rodrick, Christian <rodrick.christian@epa.gov>
Cc: Ringel, Aaron <ringel.aaron@epa.gov>; Frye, Tony (Robert) <frye.robert@epa.gov>; Palich, Christian <palich.christian@epa.gov>
Subject: INVITE: Affordable Clean Energy Rule Hill Staff Briefing

All,

I am writing to invite you to call into an EPA briefing on EPA's recently proposed Affordable Clean Energy (ACE) Rule. This morning EPA proposed the new rule to replace the prior administration's overly prescriptive and burdensome Clean Power Plan (CPP) and instead empowers states, promotes energy independence, and facilitates economic growth and job creation. More information can be found in the Press Release below.

The briefing for Capitol Hill staff will take place tomorrow, Wednesday, 8/22 at 2:45PM until 3:45PM. Please reply to this email to RSVP so that we are able to ensure we have an accurate headcount for tomorrow's briefing. Call in information is below:

Conference phone number:

Conference ID:

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

If you have any questions about the proposal or the Capitol Hill briefing, please do not hesitate to let me know. Additionally, this briefing is intended for Congressional staff only. Again, we ask that all who anticipate calling in reply to this email to RSVP.

Thank you, and we look forward to speaking to you tomorrow,

Christian Rodrick

Special Assistant

Congressional and Intergovernmental Relations

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

O: (202) 564-4828

C: (202) 578-2755

E: Rodrick.Christian@epa.gov

EPA Proposes Affordable Clean Energy (ACE) Rule

WASHINGTON (August 21, 2018) - Today, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) proposed a new rule to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from existing coal-fired electric utility generating units and power plants across the country. This proposal, entitled the Affordable Clean Energy (ACE) Rule, establishes emission guidelines for states to use when developing plans to limit GHGs at their power plants. The ACE Rule replaced the prior administration's overly prescriptive and burdensome Clean Power Plan (CPP) and instead empowers states, promotes energy independence, and facilitates economic growth and job creation.

Pursuant to President Trump's Executive Order 13873, which directed Federal agencies to review burdensome regulations, the EPA undertook a review of the CPP. Many believed the CPP exceeded EPA's authority under the Clean Air Act, which is why 27 states, 24 trade associations, 37 rural electric co-ops, and three labor unions challenged the rule. Additionally, the Supreme Court issued an unprecedented stay of the rule.

"The ACE Rule would restore the rule of law and empower states to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and provide modern, reliable, and affordable energy for all Americans," said EPA Acting Administrator Andrew Wheeler. **"Today's proposal provides the states and regulated community the certainty they need to continue environmental progress while fulfilling President Trump's goal of energy dominance."**

"EPA has an important role when it comes to addressing the CO2 from our nation's power plants," said Assistant Administrator for the Office of Air and Radiation Bill Wehrum. **"The ACE rule would fulfill this role in a manner consistent with the structure of the Clean Air Act while being equally respectful of its bounds."**

The proposal will work to reduce GHG emissions through four main actions:

1. ACE defines the "best system of emission reduction" (BSER) for existing power plants as on-site, heat-rate efficiency improvements;
2. ACE provides states with a list of "candidate technologies" that can be used to establish standards of performance and be incorporated into their state plans;
3. ACE updates the New Source Review (NSR) permitting program to further encourage efficiency improvements at existing power plants; and

4. ACE aligns regulations under CAA section 111(d) to give states adequate time and flexibility to develop their state plans.

The proposed ACE Rule is informed by more than 270,000 public comments that EPA received as part of its December 2017 Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPRM).

EPA's regulatory impact analysis (RIA) for this proposal includes a variety of scenarios. These scenarios are illustrative because the statute gives states the flexibility needed to consider unit-specific factors - including a particular unit's remaining useful life - when it comes to standards of performance. Key findings include the following:

- EPA projects that replacing the CPP with the proposal could provide \$400 million in annual net benefits.
- The ACE Rule would reduce the compliance burden by up to \$400 million per year when compared to CPP.
- All four scenarios find that the proposal will reduce CO2 emissions from their current level.
- EPA estimates that the ACE Rule could reduce 2030 CO2 emissions by up to 1.5% from projected levels without the CPP - the equivalent of taking 5.3 million cars off the road. Further, these illustrative scenarios suggest that when states have fully implemented the proposal, U.S. power sector CO2 emissions could be 33% to 34% below 2005 levels, higher than the projected CO2 emissions reductions from the CPP.

EPA will take comment on the proposal for 60 days after publication in the Federal Register and will hold a public hearing. More information including a pre-publication version of the Federal Register notice and a fact sheet are available at <https://www.epa.gov/stationary-sources-air-pollution/proposal-affordable-clean-energy-ace-rule>.